

# PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW

## 1

### November 2017 – May 2018

### Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation

### Programme

### Moldova-Ukraine



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



Project Title: Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation Programmes  
 Project Nr.: Agreement Nr. ENPI/2013/334-971

Countries: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Moldova, Ukraine

Project Starting Date: 01/01/2014  
 Reporting Period: 11//2017-05/2018  
 Project Duration: 66 months

#### Delegatee Body

Organization: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
 Address: Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5, 65760 Eschborn, Germany  
 Tel.: +995 32 2201800

Contact person: Karsten Posse  
 Function: Programme Director  
 Good Local Governance Programme South Caucasus  
 Email: [Karsten.Posse@giz.de](mailto:Karsten.Posse@giz.de)

#### Implementing Unit Managing Authority North

Organization: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
 Address: 16-B Antonovycha St., 01004, Kyiv, Ukraine  
 Tel.: +38 044 5940767

Name: Erk Roeloffs  
 Function: Team Leader Managing Authority North  
 Email: [erk.roeloffs@giz.de](mailto:erk.roeloffs@giz.de)

#### Managing Authority South

Organization: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
 Address: 42, Rustaveli Ave. / 31a, Griboedov St., 0108 Tbilisi, Georgia  
 Tel.: +995 32 2201840

Name: Natalia Alhazishvili  
 Function: Team Leader Managing Authority South  
 Email: [natalia.alhazishvili@giz.de](mailto:natalia.alhazishvili@giz.de)

Authors: Erk Roeloffs, Team Leader, Managing Authority North, Kiev/UA  
 Catalina Arghir, Finance and Contract Manager, Technical Secretariat Chisinau/MD  
 Tatiana Udrea, Finance and Contract Manager, Technical Secretariat Chisinau/MD



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## Table of Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| PROGRAMME SYNOPSIS .....  | 4         |
| INTRODUCTION.....   | 5         |
| <b>1. Executive Summary.....</b>  | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>2. Pre-Contracting:.....</b>   | <b>6</b>  |
| <b>3. Implementation Period .....</b>   | <b>7</b>  |
| 3.1 The implementation support and the first round of monitoring missions.....                | 7         |
| 3.2 The state registration of the grant contracts.....  | 8         |
| 3.3 Exclusion of project.....   | 8         |
| 3.4. Small Infrastructure Works .....   | 9         |
| 3.5 The structure of Programme budget .....   | 11        |
| 3.7. Modifications to the grant contracts .....   | 13        |
| <b>4. Indicators of achievement.....</b>  | <b>14</b> |
| 4.1 Indicators of achievement: Level of Programme .....                                       | 14        |
| 4.2 Operational objectives and priorities .....   | 14        |
| 4.3 Division of the projects according to the operational objectives and the priorities ..... | 15        |
| 4.4 Programme Monitoring Indicators .....   | 15        |
| <b>5. Summary of difficulties and lessons learned .....</b>                                   | <b>18</b> |



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## PROGRAMME SYNOPSIS

**The overall objective** of each Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation (EaPTC) Programme is to promote sustainable territorial cooperation between the participating border regions to support their social and economic development.

**The specific objective** is to strengthen cross border contacts between local authorities, communities and civil society organizations to help develop joint solutions to common social and economic development challenges in the target regions.

### Planned Results:

1. A cooperation pattern between the participating countries is established.
2. The Cooperation between local authorities, communities and civil society organizations (CSOs) in the eligible border regions of the EaP countries is increased.
3. The capacity of local and regional authorities in the EaP countries to effectively participate in EU-funded programmes is strengthened.

### Program beneficiaries and stakeholders:

1. State actors: Local and regional authorities, public service providers (hospitals, educational and research institutions, associations, institutions, organizations rendering communal and social services, cultural institutions and associations)
2. Non-state actors: CSOs (independent political and research foundations, citizens' initiatives and unions, trade unions, and youth organizations, small and medium-sized enterprises and their associations)
3. Small and medium enterprises can participate provided that the activities do not generate any profit.
4. National decision makers interested in promoting territorial cooperation with the neighboring countries also constitute a stakeholder group.
5. Donors: Donors potentially interested in the projects of the 4 TC Programmes.
6. Media: Media and press representatives producing outreach for the TC Programmes.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## INTRODUCTION

This is the first Programme Implementation Review of the Eastern Partnership Territorial Cooperation (EaPTC) Programme Moldova-Ukraine (MD-UA), co-funded by the European Union (EU) and the German Federal Ministry for Economic Development and Cooperation (BMZ), implemented by the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH in its function as Managing Authority (MA).

This Review covers the period November 2017 – May 2018. It is based on the operational objectives and priorities set in the Joint Operational Programme (JOP) MD-UA and in the individual logframes of the projects.

The Review describes the chronological sequence of the actions both on the Programme and project level from the pre-contracting stage for the applications of the lead beneficiaries endorsed by the European Commission (EC) to the stage of the first interim reporting.

The Review also contains examples of difficulties encountered and of lessons learned during the abovementioned period and a preliminary overview of the result indicators achieved by the Programme and project beneficiaries.

### 1. Executive Summary

The final evaluation report recommending 16 applications for the award of a grant (out of 154 applications) was submitted to the EC on 24.08.2016 by the MA. The final evaluation report with the main list and the reserve list of applications were partially confirmed by the European Commission (EC) on 28.10.2016. The final confirmation was received on 21.12.2016. After the confirmation by the EC, the BMZ was informed about the selected projects. Starting from 31.12.2016, due to Art. 2.5 of the Delegation Agreement (DA) between the EC and GIZ, the MA was not allowed to sign grant contracts. As a consequence, the Programme was on hold until October 2017 when the abovementioned issue was resolved.

The first implementation training and Awarding Ceremony of the TC Programme MD-UA were organized from 27.01.-03.02.2017 resp. on 01.02.2017 in Chisinau/MD, as it was expected that the issue regarding the Art. 2.5 would be resolved in a short period of time. After the amendment to the DA between the EC and GIZ was signed on 18.10.2017, 15 (out of 16) grant contracts for the TC Programme MD-UA were signed from 08.11.2017 to 12.12.2017.

The MA/TS carried out pre-contracting visits to all project beneficiaries from November 2017 until January 2018. Given the fact that the applications for the CfP had been submitted almost 2 years before the signing of the



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



contracts, the aim of the pre-contracting visits was to carry out a review of the grant application packages, especially of the budget and the log frames. In case of essential changes in the log frames and of budget positions, the JDMC was informed in writing and had to confirm the changes. In the case of the Programme MD-UA, essential changes had to be carried out in all 16 projects. The changes for 14 projects were submitted to the JDMC by March 2017, the changes for 2 projects were submitted to the JDMC by June 2018.

As nearly a year had passed since the first training, a second implementation training was organized for the beneficiaries and partners, financial managers and audit companies of all 16 projects from 01.02-02.02.2018 in Chisinau/MD.

On 18.10.2017, the EaPTC Programme was extended by 6 months to the 30.06.2019.

## 2. Pre-Contracting:

In accordance with the Practical Guide to Contract Procedures for EU External Actions (PRAG 2014), the tasks for the pre-contracting visits were as follows:

- Verification of the documents for the conclusion of the grant contracts (audit companies documents, Partnership Agreement, etc.);
- Revision of the project indicators (outputs and results);
- Revision of the procurements list;
- The budget proposed for an action by the successful applicant at the stage of the CfPs had to be corrected regarding arithmetical errors or ineligible costs prior to signing the contract;
- The Description of the Action had to be corrected accordingly if necessary;
- Findings / recommendations of the External Assessors/EvC/EC.

The results of the pre-contracting visits were stated within the pre-contracting reports, as follows:

- Some minor mistakes related to the general presentation of the budget lines were corrected;
- Measurement units for some of the lines as more suitable for financial reporting were modified;
- Costs were transferred to the relevant budget lines;
- Different budget lines were merged or divided;
- Arithmetical errors were corrected.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



As the EaPTC Programme ends on 30.06.2019, 8 (out of 16) projects had to be shortened. The end of the implementation period for the 16 project is: November (4 projects), December (1 project), January (3 projects), February (8 projects).

### 3. Implementation Period

#### 3.1 The implementation support and the first round of monitoring missions

After the trainings on implementation and reporting and the start of the projects, the MA/TS observed in the cooperation with the beneficiaries that the need for further coaching was immense, and that, in some cases, the EU experience stated in the applications and the actual experience did not coincide. In a time-consuming process, the MA/ TS provided intensive support to the beneficiaries in the following issues, among others:

- Adjustments of the grant application packs;
- Adopting project procurement procedures as per the PRAG provisions;
- Measuring and evaluating of project result indicators and updating logframe matrix;
- Advisory on the internal monitoring process;
- Advisory on tax exemption issues and support in project registration process;
- Improvement of the quality of the provided reports and relevant supporting documents that have to be provided;
- Support the implementations of the small infrastructure works component according to national legal framework and GIZ procedures;
- Advisory on visibility aspects;
- Ensure the communication with national authorities regarding the planning of the funds within the national budget;
- Support in processing of EU aid funds at local banks.

Monitoring visits were carried out to all 16 projects from 23 April 2018 till 31 May 2018.

An Implementing Manual, a Programme Visibility and Communication Manual were developed and provided to the beneficiaries.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



### 3.2 The state registration of the grant contracts

The authorities conducting the state registration of the EaPTC MD-UA grant contracts are:

- The State Chancellery of the Republic of Moldova (SC/MD)
- The Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine (MEDT/UA)

The state registration of grant contracts in MD and UA is needed for the tax exemption of the contracts. The registration of the last grant contract in MD was finalized in June 2018 in UA in October 2018.

### 3.3 Exclusion of project

In October 2017, the MA/TS came across information on the website of the National Anticorruption Center (NCA) (Moldova), stating that the partner from the selected project “Joint cycling for active Youth without borders”, Association for Applied Social Studies “ASSTREIA” was alleged to be involved in a criminal case for passive corruption regarding investment projects financed by the EC. The MA submitted an official letter to the National Authority, the State Chancellery of the Republic of Moldova, for clarification in this case who contacted the NCA. The NCA responded that, on 14.04.2017, the case nr. 2017970236 under Art. 42, 191 Paragraph (2) of the Criminal Code had been opened, regarding alleged misuse of funds. On 18.01.2018 the MA informed the JDMC MD-UA about this case and, as a consequence, according to the exclusion criteria of the PRAG (pt. 2.3.3 (a)), the MA proposed to the JDMC to exclude the abovementioned project from the list of selected projects. According to the provisions, the MA proposed to offer a contract to the first ranked project of the reserve list, the project Nr. 54/P2/2.1. On 14.02.2018, both delegations of the JDMC MD-UA approved the approach proposed by the MA. The last grant contract was signed on 16.04.2018.

The following table shows the information on the excluded project:

| Project excluded from the main list MD-UA |  |   |           |                   |
|---|--|---|-----------|-------------------|
| Application #                             | Coordinator  | Project Title   | Duration  | Suspension date   |
| 63/P3/3.2                                 | Non-government Youth Organization «Association «We Plus» | <i>“Joint cycling for active Youth without borders”</i> | 12 months | Contracting phase |

Table 1: Excluded project MD-UA



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



### 3.4. Small Infrastructure Works

According to the definition provided within the Guideline for Applicants “Small scale infrastructure works (SIW) should not exceed 30% of the total project budget”. The amount of 258.603,00 EUR was allocated to the SIW component (MD: 126.080 EUR, UA: 132.523 EUR)

According to the internal rules of GIZ, construction experts were hired in MD and UA. All construction and infrastructure components are coordinated and overseen by GIZ Head Office in Germany.

There are 7 projects MD-UA with a SIW component:

| Costs | Unit <sup>13</sup> | # of units | Unit value (in EUR) | Total Cost (in EUR) <sup>3</sup> | MD | UA |
|-------|--------------------|------------|---------------------|----------------------------------|----|----|
|-------|--------------------|------------|---------------------|----------------------------------|----|----|

| Project nr. 12/P1/1.2   |          |    |      |                 |              |              |
|---|----------|----|------|-----------------|--------------|--------------|
| <b>5.10. External expertise</b>   |          |    |      |                 |              |              |
| 5.11. Small infrastructure works - Provide investment actions for small infrastructure works to rural tourism service providers | per unit | 15 | 3000 | 45000           | 27000        | 18000        |
| <b>Total per project</b>  |          |    |      | <b>45000.00</b> | <b>27000</b> | <b>18000</b> |

| Project nr. 59/P2/2.1  |              |   |       |                 |             |              |
|--|--------------|---|-------|-----------------|-------------|--------------|
| 5.10.1. Rehabilitation of the premises for center of reception and diagnostics for the people affected by emergency situations - applicant (UA) (58,9 sq. m) | per contract | 1 | 30923 | 30923           |             | 30923        |
| 5.10.2. Repair works of the premises for center of telemedicine - applicant (UA) (20 sq. m)  | per contract | 1 | 6500  | 6500            |             | 6500         |
| 5.10.3. Repair works of the premises for center of telemedicine - co-applicant 2 (MD) (25 sq. m)   | per contract | 1 | 3000  | 3000            | 3000        |              |
| <b>Total per project</b>   |              |   |       | <b>40423.00</b> | <b>3000</b> | <b>37423</b> |

| Project nr. 77/P2/2.1  |              |   |       |                 |              |              |
|--|--------------|---|-------|-----------------|--------------|--------------|
| 5.10 Small infrastructure works  |              |   |       |                 |              |              |
| 5.10.1. Fitting out bicycles lanes, A3.3 (Edinet City Hall, MD)                        | per contract | 1 | 28900 | 28900           | 28900        |              |
| 5.10.2. Fitting out bicycle routes in Chernivtsi, A3.3 (Chernivtsi City Council, UA)   | per contract | 1 | 33450 | 33450           |              | 33450        |
| 5.10.3. Installment of bicycle racks in Chernivtsi, A3.3 (Chernivtsi City Council, UA) | per contract | 1 | 6450  | 6450            |              | 6450         |
| <b>Total per project</b>   |              |   |       | <b>68800.00</b> | <b>28900</b> | <b>39900</b> |

| Project nr. 91/P3/3.2           |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| 5.10 Small infrastructure works |  |  |  |  |  |  |



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



|  |              |      |       |                 |              |              |
|--|--------------|------|-------|-----------------|--------------|--------------|
| 5.10.1. Installation of artificial coverage (act. 2.3.) - Applicant (MD)     | Per s.m.     | 1200 | 21    | 25200           | 25200        |              |
| 5.10.2. Installation of artificial coverage (act.2.3.) - Co-applicant 1 (UA) | Per s.m.     | 1200 | 21    | 25200           |              | 25200        |
| 5.10.3. Wire fence (act.2.3.) - Applicant (MD)                               | Per m        | 240  | 33.25 | 7980            | 7980         |              |
| 5.10.4. Sports grounds fitting out works (act.2.3.) - Applicant (MD)         | Per contract | 1    | 7000  | 7000            | 7000         |              |
| 5.10.5. Installation of luminaries (act.2.3.) - Applicant (MD)               | Per unit     | 8    | 1500  | 12000           | 12000        |              |
| <b>Total per project</b>   |              |      |       | <b>77380.00</b> | <b>52180</b> | <b>25200</b> |

|   |              |   |  |             |          |  |
|---|--------------|---|--|-------------|----------|--|
| <b>Project nr. 118/P3/3.2</b>   |              |   |  |             |          |  |
| 5.10 Small infrastructure works - modernizing a sport field in Cahul (MD) - GA3.1 | per contract | 1 |  |             |          |  |
| <b>Total per project</b>  |              |   |  | <b>0.00</b> | <b>0</b> |  |

|   |          |   |      |                 |             |              |
|---|----------|---|------|-----------------|-------------|--------------|
| <b>Project nr. 139/P1/1.2</b>   |          |   |      |                 |             |              |
| 5.10 Small infrastructure works   |          |   |      |                 |             |              |
| 5.10.1 MD - Renovation of classrooms and restoration of greenhouses for practical trainings     | contract | 1 | 5000 | 5000            | 5000        |              |
| 5.10.2 UA -P1 Renovation of classrooms and restoration of greenhouses for practical trainings   | contract | 1 | 6000 | 6000            |             | 6000         |
| 5.10.2 UA -P2 - Renovation of classrooms and restoration of greenhouses for practical trainings | contract | 1 | 6000 | 6000            |             | 6000         |
| <b>Total per project</b>  |          |   |      | <b>17000.00</b> | <b>5000</b> | <b>12000</b> |

|  |              |   |       |                 |              |  |
|--|--------------|---|-------|-----------------|--------------|--|
| <b>Project nr. 147/P2/2.1</b>  |              |   |       |                 |              |  |
| 5.10 Small infrastructure works - 8 waste platforms in Valeni (MD) - A1(MD) - Activity 2.1 | per contract | 1 | 10000 | 10000           | 10000        |  |
| <b>Total per project</b>   |              |   |       | <b>10000.00</b> | <b>10000</b> |  |

|              |  |  |  |                  |               |               |
|--------------|--|--|--|------------------|---------------|---------------|
| <b>TOTAL</b> |  |  |  | <b>258603.00</b> | <b>126080</b> | <b>132523</b> |
|--------------|--|--|--|------------------|---------------|---------------|

Table 2: Overview of the construction and infrastructure components of the Programme MD-UA



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



### 3.5 The structure of Programme budget

The structure of budget of the TC Programme MD-UA is as follows:

|   | According to JOP           |  |                  | Reallocation,<br>approved on 03.08.2017 |  |                  | Reallocation,<br>approved on 13.04.2018       |   |                                       | EU Financing<br>(Grant)/<br>Disbursed till<br>06.11.2018 |
|---|----------------------------|--|------------------|---|--|------------------|---|---|---------------------------------------|--|
|   | EU<br>Financing<br>(Grant) | Private<br>financing<br>(co-<br>financing) | TOTAL<br>funding | EU<br>Financing<br>(Grant)              | Private<br>financing<br>(co-<br>financing) | Total<br>funding | EU Financing<br>(Grant)/<br><i>Contracted</i> | Private<br>financing<br>(co-financing)<br><i>Contracted</i> | Total<br>funding<br><i>Contracted</i> |  |
| <b>1<sup>st</sup> Operational<br/>Objective</b> | 1,320.0                    | 146.67                                     | 1,466.67         | 1,334.4                                 | 152.2                                      | 1,486.6          | 1,334.4                                       | 152.2   | 1,486.6                               | 1,071.4  |
| <b>2<sup>nd</sup> Operational<br/>Objective</b> | 1,320.0                    | 146.67                                     | 1,466.67         | 1,213.1                                 | 147.9                                      | 1,361.0          | 1,375.6                                       | 275,3   | 1,650.9                               | 1,023.0  |
| <b>3<sup>rd</sup> Operational<br/>Objective</b> | 660.00                     | 73.33                                      | 733.33           | 722.2                                   | 82.2                                       | 804.4            | 590.0   | 67.4  | 657.4                                 | 422.6  |
| Not contracted                                  |                            |  |                  | 30.3                                    | 0  | 0                | 0   | 0   | 0                                     |  |
| <b>TOTAL</b>                                    | <b>3,300.00</b>            | <b>366.67</b>                              | <b>3,666.67</b>  | <b>3,300.0</b>                          | <b>382.3</b>                               | <b>3,652.0</b>   | <b>3,300.0</b>                                | <b>494.9</b>  | <b>3,794.9</b>                        | <b>2,517.0</b>   |

Table 3: The structure of the Programme budget



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ

**giz** Deutsche Gesellschaft  
für Internationale  
Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

The following table provides an overview of the budgets of the 16 projects in implementation:

| Active projects    |           |  |           |                     |                     |                   |                 |                      |                                |
|--------------------|-----------|--|-----------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|-----------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|
|                    | Project # | Coordinator  | Duration  | Total budget, €     | EU contribution, €  | Co-financing, €   | Co-financing, % | 1st pre-financing, € | 2nd pre-financing disbursed, € |
| 1                  | 83249065  | "Agricola" NGO   | 12 months | 109,430.00          | 98,487.00           | 10,943.00         | 10,00 %         | 78,789.60            | -                              |
| 2                  | 83263425  | (IDIS) "Viitorul"  | 14 months | 283,000.00          | 254,700.00          | 28,300.00         | 10,00 %         | 103,407.30           | 121,822.70                     |
| 3                  | 83250532  | ODIMM  | 14 months | 263,535.65          | 234,546.73          | 28,988.92         | 11,00 %         | 92,749.09            | 101,851.90                     |
| 4                  | 83249071  | "Euroregion «Dniester»" NGO                              | 12 months | 297,125.00          | 267,412.00          | 29,713.00         | 10,00 %         | 170,549.05           | 75,337.95                      |
| 5                  | 83249068  | RMI "Emergency Hospital"                                 | 13 months | 336,528.00          | 291,848.00          | 44,680.00         | 13,28 %         | 209,773.12           | 16,862.29                      |
| 6                  | 83248905  | Edinet City Hall   | 15 months | 285,488.00          | 256,939.00          | 28,549.00         | 10,00 %         | 101,652.91           | 87,485.87                      |
| 7                  | 83263440  | "STABILITATE" NGO  | 14 months | 90,350.00           | 80,411.50           | 9,938.50          | 11,00 %         | 61,829.20            | -                              |
| 8                  | 83248937  | Ungheni City Hall  | 15 months | 262,394.10          | 236,154.71          | 26,239.39         | 10,00 %         | 78,684.00            | 107,928.92                     |
| 9                  | 83250531  | Falesti District Council                                 | 14 months | 299,112.00          | 269,200.00          | 29,912.00         | 10,01 %         | 121,140.00           | -                              |
| 10                 | 83249113  | Civil Protection and Emergency Situations Service        | 14 months | 329,894.90          | 296,905.41          | 32,989.49         | 10,00 %         | 152,346.73           | 125,176.66                     |
| 11                 | 83249116  | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency | 14 months | 142,313.00          | 127,370.14          | 14,942.86         | 10,50 %         | 41,982.44            | -                              |
| 12                 | 83249070  | "Business-Center" NGO                                    | 12 months | 252,549.00          | 227,294.10          | 25,254.90         | 10,00 %         | 181,835.28           | -                              |
| 13                 | 83248962  | Institute of Genetics of Moldova                         | 13 months | 300,000.00          | 270,000.00          | 30,000.00         | 10,00 %         | 162,015.00           | -                              |
| 14                 | 83249117  | Social Services Centre for Child and Family              | 14 months | 143,330.00          | 128,000.00          | 15,330.00         | 10,70 %         | 51,023.55            | 64,176.45                      |
| 15                 | 83248979  | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency | 12 months | 109,900.00          | 98,145.70           | 11,754.30         | 10,70 %         | 78,516.56            | -                              |
| 16                 | 83285715  | Carpinineni Vilage Hall                                  | 9 months  | 290,015.00          | 162,585.17          | 127,429.29        | 43,94 %         | 130,068.57           | -                              |
| <b>GRAND TOTAL</b> |           |  |           | <b>3,794,964.65</b> | <b>3,299,999.46</b> | <b>494,964.65</b> |                 | <b>1,816,362.40</b>  | <b>700,642.74</b>              |

Table 4: The budget of the 16 projects

### 3.6 The first reporting period

The first reporting period for 11 projects with a duration of more than 12 months and with a grant amount of more than 100.000,00 EUR was from 11.2017- 05.2018. Observations from the first reporting period are:

- All 11 reports were submitted with delays;
- 8 out of 11 submitted interim reports have been accepted by the MA;
- 3 projects are still under clarifications process;
- At least 3 rounds of clarifications were submitted to the project beneficiaries;
- 4 additional on-site visits and meetings were organized.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



The reporting status of the projects is as follows:

| Reporting status      |               |                      |                             |                          |                      |                       |                        |                   |
|-----------------------|---------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-------------------|
| Project #             | Application # | 1st pre-financing, € | 1st report, Amount reported |                          |                      | 2nd pre-financing, €* | Amount to be disbursed |                   |
|                       |               |                      | EU contribution reported, € | Co-financing reported, € | Status of the report |                       |                        |                   |
| 1                     | 83249065      | 5/P3/3.1             | 78,789.60                   |                          |                      | Not submitted         | -                      | 19,697.40         |
| 2                     | 83263425      | 12/P1/1.2            | 103,407.30                  | 73,773.08                | 0                    | Accepted              | 121,822.70             | 29,470.00         |
| 3                     | 83250532      | 17/P1/1.1            | 92,749.09                   | 52,261.17                | 100.88               | Accepted              | 101,851.90             | 39,945.74         |
| 4                     | 83249071      | 53/P1/1.2            | 170,549.05                  | 167,193.42               | 12.250.27            | Accepted              | 75,337.95              | 21,525.00         |
| 5                     | 83249068      | 59/P2/2.1            | 209,773.12                  | 98,043.57                | 26,659.52            | Accepted              | 16,862.29              | 65,212.59         |
| 6                     | 83248905      | 77/P2/2.1            | 101,652.91                  | 33,809.92                | 3,638.64             | Accepted              | 87,485.87              | 67,800.22         |
| 7                     | 83263440      | 85/P1/1.1            | 61,829.20                   |                          |                      | Not submitted         | -                      | 18,582.30         |
| 8                     | 83248937      | 91/P3/3.2            | 78,684.00                   | 34,011.56                | 0                    | Accepted              | 107,928.92             | 49,541.79         |
| 9                     | 83250531      | 100/P2/2.1           | 121,140.00                  |                          |                      | Under clarification   | -                      | 148,060.00        |
| 10                    | 83249113      | 107/P2/2.1           | 152,346.73                  | 108,329.70               | 22,831.10            | Accepted              | 125,176.66             | 19,382.02         |
| 11                    | 83249116      | 118/P3/3.2           | 41,982.44                   |                          |                      | Under clarification   | -                      | 85,387.70         |
| 12                    | 83249070      | 122/P1/1.2           | 181,835.28                  |                          |                      | Not submitted         | -                      | 45,458.82         |
| 13                    | 83248962      | 139/P1/1.2           | 162,015.00                  |                          |                      | Under clarification   | -                      | 107,985.00        |
| 14                    | 83249117      | 145/P3/3.2           | 51,023.55                   | 40,947.07                | 6,670.16             | Accepted              | 64,176.45              | 12,800.00         |
| 15                    | 83248979      | 147/P2/2.1           | 78,516.56                   |                          |                      | Not submitted         | -                      | 19,629.14         |
| 16                    | 83285715      | 54/P2/2.1            | 130,068.57                  |                          |                      | Not submitted         | -                      | 32,516.60         |
| <b>TOTAL projects</b> |               |                      | <b>1,816,362.40</b>         | <b>608,369.49</b>        | <b>59,900.30</b>     |                       | <b>700,642.74</b>      | <b>782,994.32</b> |

Table 5: Reporting status

\*The disbursement was made after May 2018

### 3.7. Modifications to the grant contracts

Due to a technical mistake, the grant contracts MD-UA were signed with a wording that did not foresee the InforEuroRate as the exchange rate for reporting. This was resolved by addenda to the grants contracts which were signed from 20 July 2018 to 07 August 2018.

More modifications to the following grant contracts were carried out as follows:

| Addenda to Grant Contracts |                |                          |         |                  |                  |   |
|----------------------------|----------------|--------------------------|---------|------------------|------------------|---|
| Project #                  | Project status | Coordinator              | Add. No | Date of addendum | Approved by JDMC | Details   |
| 83249068                   | Active         | RMI "Emergency Hospital" | 2       | 27.11.2018       | 23.11.2018       | The Project beneficiary requested an extension of the Project Implementation period for 1 month, from 12 months to 13 months. |
| 83248905                   | Active         | Edinet City Hall         | 2       |                  | 23.11.2018       | The Project beneficiary requested an extension of the Project Implementation period for 1 month, from 14 months to 15 months  |
| 83248937                   | Active         | Ungheni City Hall        | 2       |                  | 23.11.2018       | The Project beneficiary requested an extension of the Project Implementation period for 1 month, from 14 months to 15 months  |

Table 6: Addenda to grant contracts



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## 4. Indicators of achievement

### 4.1 Indicators of achievement: Level of Programme

The following qualitative and quantitative indicators are listed to measure the effect of the information and capacity building activities and their contribution to the ENPI Regional East Programme Strategy Paper.

| Indicator   | Measured by:  | Target | Achieved |
|---|---|--------|----------|
| Increased level of structured and institutionalized contacts between local authorities of the bordering regions | Number of applications received in response to a call for proposals | 120    | 154      |
|   | Number of organizations involved in the applications                | 336    |          |
| Number of joint projects implemented across the borders   | Number of grant contracts signed                                    | 20     | 16       |
|   | Number of projects completed  | 20     | 0        |
| The increased intensity of cross-border contacts between the local communities                                  | Number of joint cross-border events implemented within the projects | 75     |          |

Table 7: Indicators of achievement on Programme level

### 4.2 Operational objectives and priorities

The TC Programme MD-UA has the 3 following Operational Objectives and relevant priorities:

| Operational Objective  | Priorities   |
|--|--|
| 1. Improving the living conditions of local communities in the target cross-border regions through joint projects supporting economic and social development | 1.1. Promotion of closer business links across the border  |
|  | 1.2. Diversification of income sources and development of alternative employment opportunities in rural areas          |
| 2. Addressing common challenges in the fields of environment, employment, public health and any other field of common interest                               | 2.1. Solving cross-border environmental problems, enhancing emergency preparedness                                     |
| 3. Culture, education and sports   | 3.1. Promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integration of ethnical minorities across the border             |
|  | 3.2. Facilitation of people-to-people links in social sphere, culture, education and sports with focus on youth issues |

Table 8: Operational objectives and priorities



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



### 4.3 Division of the projects according to the operational objectives and the priorities

| Operational objectives   | Priorities  | Reference number         | Title of the Action  |
|--|---|--------------------------|--|
| 1. Improving the living conditions of local communities in the target cross-border regions through joint projects supporting economic and social development | 1.1. Promotion of closer business links across the border   | 17/P1/1.1.<br>(83250532) | Joint Opportunities in Business for Youth (JOBS for Youth)   |
|  |   | 85/P1/1.1.<br>(83263440) | Development of the Ukrainian-Moldavian cross-border production-scientific-educational cluster for processing of winemaking by-products                             |
|  | 1.2. Diversification of income sources and development of alternative employment opportunities in rural areas         | 53/P1/1.2<br>(83249071)  | Cross border network for Innovative Agriculture  |
|  |   | 139/P1/1.2<br>(83248962) | Strengthening Regional Capacities for Applying Environmentally Friendly Technologies in Integrated Pest Management Systems   |
|  |   | 12/P1/1.2<br>(83263425)  | Rural tourism – a sure step towards boosting the cross-border cooperation between districts of Soroca (Republic of Moldova) and Yampil (Ukraine, Vinnytsya Oblast) |
|  |   | 122/P1/1.2<br>(83249070) | Common Space for Creative and Cultural Industries  |
| 2. Addressing common challenges in the fields of environment, employment, public health and any other field of common interest                               | 2.1. Solving cross-border environmental problems, enhancing emergency preparedness                                    | 59/P2/2.1<br>(83249068)  | Increase of the emergency situations preparedness level of medical structures and population of the regions of Ukraine and Republic of Moldova                     |
|  |   | 147/P2/2.1<br>(83248979) | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency (RM)  |
|  |   | 100/P2/2.1<br>(83250531) | Falesti District Council (RM)  |
|  |   | 77/P2/2.1<br>(83248905)  | Edinet City Hall (RM)  |
|  |   | 107/P2/2.1<br>(83249113) | Civil Protection and Emergency Situations Service of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Moldova (RM)  |
|  |   | 54/P2/2.1<br>(83285715)  | Cross-border rural network for green environment   |
| 3. Culture, education and sports   | 3.1. Promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integration of ethnic minorities across the border              | 5/P3/3.1<br>(83249065)   | Promotion of Food Heritage in the Lower Danube Region (RiverFood)  |
|  | 3.2 Facilitation of people-to-people links in social sphere, culture, education and sports with focus on youth issues | 91/P3/3.2<br>(83248937)  | Healthy way by Upgraded Cross-border Sport Infrastructure  |
|  |   | 118/P3/3.2<br>(83249116) | Youth in Action  |
|  |   | 145/P3/3.2<br>(83249117) | Facilitation of people-to-people links in social, cultural and educational sphere with focus on young care leavers from Republic of Moldova and Cernivtzi region   |

Table 9: Division of projects according to the operational objectives and the priorities

### 4.4 Programme Monitoring Indicators

The following table contains the project result indicators as per the Joint Operational Programme collected (mainly after the analysis of the interim reports of the first reporting period from 11.2017- 05.2018).



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



| Operational Objective   | Priority   | Output indicators   | Result indicators  |  |
|---|--|---|--|--|
| 1. Improving the living conditions of local communities in the border regions through joint projects supporting economic and social development | 1.1 Promotion of closer business links across the border   | Number of projects providing support to enterprises in the region/ aiming at improving conditions for entrepreneurship/ establishing cross-border business networks | Number of SMEs/ entrepreneurs that took part in events organised by the projects/benefited from the actions  |  |
|   |  |   | Number of cross-border partnerships/ initiatives/ business networks and clusters established   |  |
|   |  |   | Number of newly established cross-border partnerships between local and regional academic institutions, think tanks, research centres                      |  |
|   |  | Number of projects aiming to establish and support cross-border research networks/ innovation and business clusters   | Number of joint researches, studies, strategies on regional social-economic development issues published   |  |
|   |  |   | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues to the cross-border business development |  |
|   | 1.2 Diversification of income sources and development of alternative employment opportunities in rural areas | Number of projects in the field of rural development  | Number of new joint vocational education and training curricula upgraded, developed and introduced   |  |
|   |  |   | Number of SMEs/entrepreneurs based in the rural areas across the border using the outputs of the projects  |  |
|   |  | Number of projects in the field of vocational education and training focusing on re-qualification of rural population   | Number of stakeholders covered by cross-border education projects  |  |
|   |  |   | Number of new working places for young people created in the services sector in rural areas  |  |
|   |  |   | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues related to cross-border rural            |  |



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



|                                   |  |   |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------------|--|---|--|--|--|
|                                   |  |   |  | development  |  |
| 2. Addressing common challenges   | 2.1 Solving cross-border environmental problems, enhancing emergency preparedness  | Number of projects targeting cross-border emergency issues  |  | Number of newly established cross-border structures and mechanisms, efficiently managing protected areas and natural resources |  |
|                                   |  |   |  | Number of established/supported networks to exchange information and coordinate protection measures                            |  |
|                                   |  | Number of projects targeting cross-border emergency issues  |  | Number of joint management plans/ strategies developed and/or implemented  |  |
|                                   |  |   |  | Number of people targeted by information/awareness activities promoting sustainable use of natural resources                   |  |
|                                   |  | Number of projects establishing direct cross-border cooperation among counterparts in the field of environment  |  | Number of partnerships established between emergency institutions across the border  |  |
|                                   |  |   |  | Number of institutionalised and sustainable cross border partnerships, networks, associations and other structures             |  |
|                                   | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues related to environment |   |  |  |  |
| 3. Culture, education, and sports | 3.1 Promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integration of ethnical minorities across the border                                | Number of projects that address issues related to promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integrity of ethnical minorities across the border |  | Number of organisations and people involved in cross-border activities   |  |
|                                   | 3.2 Facilitation of people-to-people links in social sphere, culture, education and sports with focus                                    | Number of projects that include cultural and sports activities with the participation of representatives from both sides of the common border         |  | Number of initiatives launched and implemented   |  |
|                                   |  |   |  | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects involving participation of     |  |



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



|  |                 |   |  |  |  |
|--|-----------------|---|--|--|--|
|  | on youth issues |   |  | youth and other civil society organisations  |  |
|  |                 | Number of projects implemented to improve communication and cooperation across the border |  | Number of cross-border networks involving youth/ educational/ cultural/ social organisations established and supported |  |

Table 10: Programme Monitoring Indicators

## 5. Summary of difficulties and lessons learned

The main issues encountered on the Programme level within the implementation phase of the EaPTC Programme MD-UA were:

- A legal framework issue related to Art. 2.5 in the DA between the EC the MA which resulted to almost a year of delay for the Implementation;
- Local providers of goods and services are not familiar with the tax exception;
- Lack of experience of local banks in the processing of EU aid funds.

The main issues encountered on the project level were:

- The projects need more coaching in EU and local legislation than expected;
- The projects need more networking for finding synergies;
- Low quality of the provided reports and lack of relevant supporting documents submitted by the projects;
- Low quality of all audit reports;
- Deficiencies regarding the planning of the funds within the national budget;
- Difficulties in the implementation of SIW component.

At this stage, the following components of sustainability can be observed:

- ✓ Most projects contribute to local and regional development plans;
- ✓ Most projects contributed to sustainability and will continue beyond project completion.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ

